

Evaluation of the Implementation of the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Program in the Empowerment of SMEs at PT Pertamina Patra Niaga's Tanjung Gerem Fuel Terminal in Cilegon

Rudi Martahi Nauli* , Suwaib Amiruddin, Rina Yulianti

Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa, Indonesia

Email: rudimnsgrg@gmail.com*, suwaibamiruddin@untirta.ac.id,
rina.yulianti@untirta.ac.id

Keywords	Abstract
Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR); Program Evaluation; MSME Empowerment; OECD/DAC; PT Pertamina Patra Niaga; Program Sustainability.	This study aims to evaluate the implementation of the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Program of PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal Tanjung Gerem in empowering Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in Gerem Village, Cilegon City. The research uses a descriptive qualitative method with an evaluative approach based on OECD/DAC criteria which include relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability. Data collection was carried out through in-depth interviews, observations, documentation studies, and data triangulation, then analyzed using the help of NVivo software. The results of the study show that the CSR program has provided positive benefits for fostered MSMEs through increasing business capacity, legality, product quality, and increasing income. However, various obstacles are still found, such as limitations in production, processing, marketing, and suboptimal collaboration between companies, local governments, and the community. In addition, the sustainability of the program still faces challenges in the form of the lack of sustainable market certainty for MSME products so that marketing still depends on promotional activities and exhibitions. Although administratively the program has achieved the set targets, the evaluation shows the need to strengthen governance, increase synergy between stakeholders, and develop market access so that CSR programs can have a more sustainable impact on MSME empowerment and community welfare.

INTRODUCTION

The concept of corporate social responsibility or *Corporate social responsibility* (CSR) has undergone a significant shift. From what was previously seen as a mere philanthropic activity or a form of momentary concern, CSR has now developed into a strategic approach that is integrated into company operations. In Indonesia, this shift is strengthened by regulations such as Law Number 40 of 2007 concerning Limited Liability Companies and (Kementerian BUMN, 2021) Regulation of the Minister of SOEs Number PER-05/MBU/04/2021 which emphasizes that CSR, especially within the scope of State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs), is a moral as well as a legal obligation. This makes CSR no longer an additional program, but an important part of the company's commitment to sustainability and community welfare. The concept refers to the values and standards related to the operation of a company in a society, meaning that CSR is a business commitment to operate legally and ethically that contributes to improving the quality of life of stakeholders including employees and their families, local communities and the wider community in the framework

of realizing sustainable development. In this concept, the company is expected to meet the scope of *Triple Bottom Line: People, Planet and Profit*. This means that the company does not only carry out business activities for the sake of making profits (*Profit*), but also contribute to the goodness, progress and welfare of the community (*people*) and environment (*Planet*) by participating in various social activities that are useful for the community.

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) is a form of the company's commitment to contribute to improving the quality of life of the community and creating a harmonious relationship with the company's surrounding environment. According to Poerwanto (2010), CSR is realized through various programs that provide benefits to the community. Meanwhile, Pearce (2013) explained that the implementation of CSR is based on four main responsibilities, namely economic, legal, ethical, and discretionary responsibility. Good CSR implementation not only provides benefits to the community, but is also able to improve the company's image, reduce business risks, expand market access, increase employee motivation, and strengthen relationships with stakeholders. On the other hand, the community benefits in the form of improving welfare, opening up job opportunities, economic empowerment, solving environmental problems, and strengthening social life as stated by Wibisono (2007) and Rachman (2015).

The development of CSR implementation in Indonesia shows an increasingly positive trend, marked by an increase in the number of companies implementing CSR programs both in the form of charity activities and community empowerment. This is also supported by various local government regulations that regulate the company's obligations in carrying out social and environmental responsibilities (Demokrasi, 2024). In Banten Province, the implementation of CSR is regulated through Regional Regulation Number 5 of 2016 concerning Corporate Social Responsibility, Partnership, and Community Development which requires each company to prepare a CSR program and budget in a proper and proportionate manner. Although Banten's economic growth is relatively stable (Bastianingrum, 2023), there are still challenges in the form of poverty, unemployment, and economic inequality (Safitri et al., 2022) which show that the benefits of development have not been felt evenly, especially by Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs).

Cilegon City as one of the strategic industrial estates in Banten Province has different characteristics compared to other areas due to the high concentration of industries adjacent to residential areas. This condition causes the need for CSR programs to become increasingly important as an effort to create a balance between industrial activities and community welfare. The Cilegon City Government has also stipulated Regional Regulation Number 10 of 2012 concerning Corporate Social Responsibility Management which regulates the company's contribution to social, economic, and environmental development. The existence of these regulations is the basis for companies to implement CSR programs that are oriented towards community empowerment in a sustainable manner (Agus, 2020; Armansyah & Fadjar, 2024; Kunyanti & Mujiono, 2021; Primec & Belak, 2022; Saleh et al., 2022).

One of the companies that implements CSR programs in Cilegon City is PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal Tanjung Gerem. As a fuel distribution terminal located in Grogol District, the company has direct proximity to the community so that the implementation of CSR is an important part in maintaining relationships with the surrounding environment. In 2024, the company will implement the Grogol District MSME Empowerment Program

through various activities, such as training, business assistance, capacity building for MSME actors, marketing facility assistance, and the development of the MSME Gallery Corner managed with the Grogol District MSME Forum. The program aims to increase the competitiveness of MSMEs so that they can develop independently and sustainably (Al Mamun & Muniady, 2021; Rochayatun et al., 2023; Sari & Kusumawati, 2022).

Although various empowerment activities have been carried out, the 2024 program implementation report shows that there are still several aspects that need to be improved. Collaboration between companies, governments, and the community is considered not optimal, so more effective communication is needed to support the success of the program. In addition, the results of initial observations show that some fostered MSMEs still face obstacles in terms of production, processing, and product marketing. The work plan document also shows that all activities have been carried out as scheduled, but it is not yet certain whether all programs are really in accordance with the needs of MSME actors. On the other hand, the evaluation document shows excellent administrative achievements, but still provides recommendations to increase community participation so that the success of the program in a substantive way still needs to be studied further.

The research gap lies in the limited application of comprehensive OECD/DAC evaluation criteria—specifically relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability—to assess CSR programs in the MSME empowerment context in Indonesian industrial areas. While previous studies have examined CSR implementation in various contexts, there is limited research that systematically evaluates CSR programs using the OECD/DAC framework in the context of MSME empowerment around fuel terminal operations. The study by Susatyo et al. (2025) focused on SROI analysis rather than the full OECD/DAC criteria, while Prihatin et al. (2024) examined CSR policies more broadly without specifically focusing on MSME empowerment programs. Additionally, there is limited research on how spatial constraints and industrial safety regulations create unique challenges for CSR programs in fuel terminal areas. The novelty of this research lies in its comprehensive application of the six OECD/DAC criteria to evaluate a CSR program in the MSME empowerment context, its use of NVivo software for qualitative data analysis, and its focus on the specific challenges of implementing CSR programs in areas with industrial safety constraints.

Based on these conditions, the evaluation of the implementation of PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal's Tanjung Gerem CSR program is important to find out the extent to which the program has been running effectively in empowering MSMEs. This research is focused on identifying obstacles faced by fostered MSMEs, analyzing the suitability of the program with the needs of the community, and evaluating the achievements, benefits, use of resources, and sustainability of the program. The results of the research are expected to provide input for companies, local governments, and other stakeholders in improving the quality of CSR implementation, as well as enriching academic studies on the implementation of corporate social responsibility in community empowerment.

METHOD

Research Design

This study used a descriptive qualitative research method with an evaluative approach to examine the implementation of PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal's Tanjung Gerem Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) program in empowering MSMEs. The qualitative approach was chosen so that the researcher could gain an in-depth understanding through interviews, observations, and documentation studies, while the descriptive approach was used to describe the implementation of programs, objectives, and dynamics that occurred in the field. Furthermore, an evaluative approach is used to assess the effectiveness of program implementation based on OECD/DAC (2021) criteria, which include relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability. This study focuses on evaluating the obstacles faced by fostered MSMEs in the aspects of production, processing, and marketing, the suitability of the programs that have been implemented with the needs of MSMEs, as well as the assessment of the results of program evaluations that administratively show 100% achievements, but still require increased participation and substantive strengthening of success. The results of the research are expected to provide a comprehensive overview of the implementation of CSR programs as well as provide input for companies in increasing the effectiveness of MSME empowerment in the future.

This research was carried out in Gerem Village, Grogol District, Cilegon City, Banten Province, which is an area directly affected by the operational activities of PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal Tanjung Gerem so it is relevant as a research location regarding the implementation of the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) program in empowering MSMEs. The research is planned to last for six months, from January to June 2026. During this period, research activities include the stages of preparing proposals, collecting data through interviews, observations, and documentation studies, data analysis, preparation of research reports, and the implementation of thesis exams. The schedule for the implementation of the research is systematically prepared so that each stage can run according to the plan and time target that has been set.

Data Collection Techniques

The data collection technique in this study uses a triangulation approach of sources and methods to obtain in-depth and accurate data. The researchers utilized four main techniques:

1. Literature Studies: This technique is used to review academic literature, books, scientific journals, laws and regulations, as well as annual reports of companies related to the concept and implementation of CSR. This study provides a theoretical and contextual basis that strengthens the foundation of the research.
2. Interviews: The researcher conducted semi-structured interviews with key informants such as PT Pertamina Patra Niaga's CSR officer, community leaders, Gerem Village government officials, and beneficiary residents. The interviews are designed openly so that respondents can explain their views and experiences in depth regarding the implementation of CSR in their region.
3. Documentation: Documentation data is obtained from various official documents and archives of CSR activities, including program implementation reports, photo documentation of activities, meeting minutes, and internal company policy documents. This technique is used to complete and verify data from interviews and observations.

4. Observation: Observation is carried out in a participatory and non-participatory manner to directly observe the implementation of CSR programs in the field. The researcher recorded the activities, community involvement, and physical or environmental conditions resulting from the CSR program. This technique is important to understand the context of the implementation directly and objectively.

Data Analysis Techniques

Data analysis is carried out with inductive logic, which is drawing conclusions from specific findings towards a general understanding. The data was analyzed using Miles and Huberman's interactive techniques: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawn. This process is cyclical and continues throughout the study.



Diagram 1 Data Analysis Engineering Cycle

Source: Processed Personally

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

After describing the field findings in an evaluative descriptive manner in the previous section, this sub-chapter of discussion integrates all the achievements of the MSME Empowerment CSR Program of PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal (FT) Tanjung Gerem through a comprehensive synthesis of the six pillars of the OECD/DAC qualitative criteria (*Relevance, Coherence, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact, and Sustainability*). Theoretically, the implementation of this program has succeeded in proving that community-based development interventions that are designed in a targeted manner can act as a dual instrument, namely as a micro-economic driver for the residents of the affected areas as well as a strategy for mitigating socio-sociological risks around the fuel terminal area as a National Vital Object. The successful transformation from fulfilling daily functional needs to the entrepreneurial mental independence of the village MSME Forum was achieved thanks to the work of a dynamic and adaptive cross-actor collaborative governance model (*pentahelix*). In order to gain a depth of understanding of the conceptual structure, the emphasis on the weight of the theme, and the degree of intimacy of the relationship between the codes of all these empirical findings, the next discussion section is strengthened with analytical visualization using qualitative data matrix modeling through the help of NVivo 15 software.

Following the theoretical synthesis based on OECD/DAC criteria in the previous section, the objectivity and accountability of qualitative analysis in this study was strengthened through word frequency visualization modeling (*Word Frequency Analysis*) with the help of NVivo

software. Methodologically, word frequency analysis serves to identify the level of *conceptual density* and map the main terms or keywords that most dominate the cognition and articulation of the informants during the in-depth interview process. By calculating the weight of the appearance of keywords from all member-check transcripts of the source, the researcher can see the main focus of the aspiration net objectively. The results of the word frequency graph extraction are presented in the following Figure 4.7:

Figure 1 Results of *Word Frequency Query* of the MSME Empowerment Program
Source: Researcher 2026

Based on the visualization of the word distribution matrix shown in Figure 4.7, the pattern of keyword mapping that emerged predominantly reflects the consistency of empirical focus in the field. The words that have the largest visual size show the highest frequency of occurrence in the interview database. The word density pattern can be classified into three main interrelated thematic clusters:

1. Operational Policy Cluster and Actor Structure: Keywords such as "Program", "CSR", "MSMEs", "Pertamina", and "Community" occupy the highest frequency hierarchy. The conceptual density in this cluster indicates that the main discourse space in the collective memory of informants is centered on the symbiotic relationship between corporations (FT Tanjung Gerem) as policy providers and local communities in Gerem Village as subjects of economic empowerment.
2. Field Intervention Process Cluster (*Mechanism*): The constant occurrence of keywords such as "Training", "Assistance", "Tools", and "Mentoring" reflects the tangible form of the tactical implementation stages in the field. This word structure validates the findings on the *Effectiveness and Efficiency* dimensions, which empirically prove that Pertamina does not just implement an instant philanthropic pattern (capital assistance), but focuses its intervention on the transfer of technology on modern production machinery and intensive managerial capacity guidance.
3. Cluster of Achievement and Impact Indicators: Terms such as "Business", "Revenue", "Independence", and "Legality" represent the long-term orientation of the program's success. The high frequency of the words "income" and "independent" is an anchor of qualitative evidence that corroborates the findings on the Impact and Sustainability dimensions. This indicates the success of the program intervention in changing the mindset of traditional business actors to a financially independent entrepreneurial mindset.

regional policy integration (OECD, 2021) and the operation of multi-actor collaborative governance (Ansell & Gash, 2008). Meanwhile, in the downstream chain (right branch), the branching of sentences proves that the output of corporate social responsibility has succeeded in stimulating the economic impact and mental independence of businesses that are oriented towards solving real problems of the community (Patton, 2008)

Based on the conceptual branching structure formed in Figure 4.8, the researcher conducted a specific analysis of the relationships, linkages, and contextual meanings of the dominance of the word "program" that is directly associated with the OECD/DAC evaluation indicators:

1. Upstream Conceptual Chain (Left Branch / *Pre-Context*)

The branches on the left side that lead to the word "program" are dominated by institutional verbs and adjectives such as "implementation...", "suitability...", "synergy in...", and "evaluation of...". This pattern shows two strong sociological linkages:

- a. *Relevance*: The context of the sentence that precedes the word program is often spoken by *the Fuel Terminal Manager* (Informant 1a), the Gerem Village Head (Informant 3a), and the Community Leader (Informant 6a) when explaining the planning phase, where the "initial suitability of the program" is designed based on the results of social *mapping*.
- b. *Coherence*: The branching of the sentence using the phrase "synergy in the program" represents the views of the Cooperatives & MSMEs Office (Informant 2a) and the Village Secretary (Informant 3b). This conceptually validates that private/state-owned intervention does not stand independently (*isolated*), but is attached to the framework of the local government's Strategic Plan to eliminate budget overlap.

2. Downstream Conceptual Chains (Right Branch / *Post-Context*)

The branches on the right side that grow from the word "program" are the thickest and longest part of the word tree. This branching pattern specifically leads to operational terminology such as "... empowerment of MSMEs, "... help with automatic production tools", "... separate financial management training", and "... it really helps increase turnover". This downstream structure contains the essence of functional interventions at the site level:

- a. *Effectiveness & Efficiency*: When *the Comdev Officer* (Informant 1c) and Sr. Spv HSSE (Informant 1b) pronounce the word "program", the right branch is directly connected with "... training" and "... field assistance". This proves that the mechanism for delivering aid runs effectively through face-to-face classes and periodic monitoring, even though it had triggered problems in the efficiency of time allocation for housewives.
- b. *Impact & Sustainability*: The right branch sourced from the voices of fostered MSME actors (Informants 4a to 4e) constantly connect the word "program" with the predicate "... make our efforts upgrade" and "... change our mentality to be independent". This conceptual linkage locks qualitative evidence that the outputs of this corporate social responsibility program have succeeded in stimulating real economic impacts (increase in turnover ranging from 30% - 40%) and ensuring the sustainability of the business independently after graduation or graduation from Pertamina's Fuel Terminal.

Epistemologically, the visualization of the NVivo 15-word tree confirms that the word "program" is not just an administrative label that is spoken randomly by the speakers. This word serves as an integrator node that binds all qualitative evaluation instruments. This word tree proves the existence of harmony of thought (*cognitive alignment*) between the strategic

intentions of FT Tanjung Gerem's corporate management, government bureaucratic regulations, and the empirical reality felt by the grassroots community in the economic empowerment ecosystem.

Reconstruction of Fostered MSME Constraints

To answer the first research objective regarding the identification of obstacles faced by fostered MSMEs in the aspects of production, processing, and marketing, the researcher conducted an in-depth analytical reconstruction. Based on descriptive findings in the field, the obstacles faced by micro business actors in the Gerem Village area should not be viewed narrowly as a purely technical-mechanical problem (such as limited capital or simple packaging). Theoretically, qualitative analysis requires researchers to draw these site barriers into a broader dimension, namely the survivalist trap and the existence of inherent spatial-regulatory barriers around the operational area of national energy distribution (Miles et al., 2014).

The dimensions of production and processing constraints experienced by Informants 4a to 4e are rooted in the phenomenon *the survivalist trap*, where this local entrepreneurial startup was born not because of the push for macro market innovation, but because of the additional economy to survive from the constraints of the informal economy. The characteristics of this home business are based on a single workforce (*single fighter*) dominated by women/housewives' groups. As a result, there is a clash of sociological capabilities in the form of a double burden (*double burden*), where business actors must divide their daily focus between taking care of the domestic sphere and maintaining the work rhythm of commodity production. The dependence on conventional domestic kitchen appliances that had been complained about by Informant 4d (catering cluster) and Informant 4e (instant red ginger cluster) is actually a manifestation of the upper limit of capability (*capability ceiling*) micro businesses that find it difficult to accumulate capital independently (Patton, 2008).

Furthermore, the researcher found spatial barriers that are of very crucial value and specific to MSMEs around the PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal (FT) Tanjung Gerem area. As a national vital object that manages large-scale fuel oil logistics, the safety aspect of the industry (*safety compliance*) is an absolute priority that gives birth to natural barriers (*natural barrier*) for the local MSME ecosystem. The presentation from Informant 1b (Sr. Spv HSSE) emphasized that there is a very strict curation of the type of business of MSME assisted residents. These industry regulatory obstacles limit the space for physical expansion and diversification of community product variations. Business actors do not have the freedom to develop the type of large-scale manufacturing or heavy food processing MSMEs that require intensive open flame burning methods or high-pressure gas installations around fuel terminal safety buffer zones. This protective spatial barrier locks the MSMEs of Gerem Village in the dry food and herbal medicine clusters which economically have profit margins that tend to be stable but slow to make a leap on a large industrial scale.

In the downstream business, marketing constraints are closely related to the absence of a formal legal legitimacy ecosystem in the pre-program phase. The absence of NIB, PIRT, and Halal certification documents acts as an administrative barrier that closes the total access of local products to be integrated into *the commercial supply chain integration*. The stagnant and localized marketing chain on the pick-and-sell model in small stalls around the house at low

prices as complained by Informant 4c (sea cracker cluster) indicates that the marketing obstacles of traditional MSMEs are not just a problem of weaknesses in plastic packaging design, but also the lack of legal recognition from the state over their business units.

Through the visualization of the word tree (*word tree*) NVivo, which binds the keyword "program", it is clear that Pertamina's CSR intervention in the form of sending spinner machines, continuous sealers, packaging printing, and escorting mass permits is a very accurate step (Jackson & Bazeley, 2019). The assistance package has proven to be functional in breaking the technical deadlock in the production and processing aspects. However, the discovery of the root of this structural problem emphasizes that to achieve a complete transformation of the business class, future interventions must not stop at the provision of kitchen appliance stimulants, but must touch on the reform of time management of business actors and the easing of formal market access structures that are able to penetrate the spatial boundaries outside the fuel terminal.

Relations Between Parties and Cross-Sector Program Suitability

If we look at the data on the implementation of the company's CD 2024 program, multi-stakeholder cooperation (*pentahelix*) between companies, local governments, and the community is considered to have run very harmoniously. However, if dissected more critically in this part of the discussion, the researcher finds two important problems related to this relationship between actors, namely the existence of role inequality where cooperation is still dominated by companies (*pseudo-pentahelix*), as well as the clash of dual roles in the company's internal management itself (Ansell & Gash, 2008).

1. Inequality in Actor Relations and Government Roles That Are Still Administrative

In empowerment theory, the long-term success of a CSR program is highly dependent on commitment and a balanced division of roles between private companies/SOEs and local governments. However, the facts on the ground show that the MSME Empowerment CSR Program is still running with a pattern *corporate-driven*, meaning that all program control from funding, provision of automatic production equipment technology, to determining the direction of training is fully driven and borne by PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal (FT) Tanjung Gerem.

The local government, in this case the Cilegon City Cooperatives & MSMEs Office and the Gerem Village bio bureaucracy, is still at the passive administrative level. This means that government agencies are only limited to helping take care of business legality (NIB and PIRT) and keeping the assistance from Pertamina from overlapping with the government's assistance programs. This was revealed from the explanation of the representative of the Cilegon City Cooperatives & MSMEs Office (Informant 2a):

"We see that this program has very high coherence and alignment with the Strategic Plan (Renstra) of the Cilegon City Cooperatives & MSMEs Office... The synergy of coordination in the field is quite intensive; The company always coordinates with us, so that the policies derived by CSR are well integrated, complement the gap in the coverage of the regional budget, and do not run in an overlapping manner." (Interview with Informant 2a).

The nature of similar support was also affirmed by the village through the Village Secretary (Informant 3b) who focused on administrative order:

"From the village side, our function is to ensure administrative order. We synchronize data so that the tool assistance from Pertamina's CSR is neatly recorded and does not overlap with the local government's assistance program. This cross-sector coordination is going very well because it involves the Village MSME Forum as a one-stop data consolidation forum." (Interview with Informant 3b).

From the two quotes above, the researcher analyzed that although coordination went well to prevent overlap (*overlapping budget*), the local government has not conducted resource pooling or participated in a budget joint venture to strengthen the Gerem Village MSME Forum. The adverse impact is the emergence of institutional dependence (Elfianto et al., 2026). If one day Pertamina stops this program (*exit strategy*), the MSME Forum is at risk of regression because the local government has not prepared a special regional budget to continue the development of this MSME group independently.

2. Divided Work Focus

The second problem that makes daily assistance for MSMEs less efficient is the division of work focus on the company's internal organizational structure. At FT Tanjung Gerem, field officers (Comdev Officers) are directly under the supervision of the HSSE (Health, Safety, Security, and Environment) division. This has caused a clash of highly contradictory work cultures in the field.

The HSSE Division has the main task of enforcing strict, rigid, and disciplined work safety rules in order to maintain the operational safety of fuel terminals as a National Vital Object from the risk of fire hazards. On the contrary, the task of community empowerment (*Community Development*) requires a work character that is very flexible, friendly, and adaptive to the social conditions of MSME actors, the majority of whom are housewives. As a result of this dual role, time management for daily monitoring is hampered, as honestly acknowledged by Sr. Spv HSSE (Informant 1b):

"The main obstacle that we identified from the supervision level is the division of internal operational time. Because our field staff team has to split the focus between daily HSSE monitoring and a busy MSME mentoring schedule, time management can sometimes be a challenge. However, we work around it by putting together a systematic work timeline..." (Interview with Informant 1b).

The confession from Informant 1b explains why the program coaching material from Pertamina is very locked to the types of MSMEs processed dry food and herbal powder. This strict curation is carried out to maintain the safety zone so that no MSMEs use the large open fire burning method, because it violates safety rules outside the fuel terminal area. So, the suitability of the design of this program was actually born from a compromise between meeting the economic needs of citizens and the importance of industrial security.

The researcher concluded that the support of related parties for Research Objective 2 has been well underway in terms of maintaining regional security and avoiding overlapping formal budgets. However, in order for this assistance to be maximized in the future, the company's internal organizational structure needs to be separated so that the community empowerment function is not disrupted by HSSE's operational tasks, and the Cilegon City Cooperative Office must start providing real coaching fund support, not just administrative support on paper (Patton, 2008).

Sustainability of CSR Programs

Evaluate the implementation of CSR programs in terms of achieving targets, resource utilization, tangible benefits felt by the community, and how the future of sustainability (*sustainability*) fostered MSME efforts. Although the report data shows that this program is 100% successful and business actors feel the benefits in the form of an increase in turnover of between 30% and 40%, the researcher sees that there are still two fundamental challenges that could threaten the independence of these MSMEs in the future if the assistance program from the company is stopped (*exit strategy*). The two problems are the lack of binding downstream market certainty (*lack of secured off-taker*) and the use of the program as a guarantee of social permission to operate (*social license to operate*) by the company (Patton, 2008).

1. Limited Access to Markets and Repeat Buyers

The technological assistance of production equipment from PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal (FT) Tanjung Gerem has proven to be successful in increasing the business production capacity of MSME fostered residents. However, this increase in production risks becoming suboptimal if it is not balanced with market certainty in the *Demand*. Researchers found that the current market ecosystem is still seasonal, uncertain, and not yet bound by fixed trade contracts.

Concerns about the lack of permanent buyers post-this program were felt directly by Informant 4d (Traditional Catering & Cake Business Actors):

"Indeed, now we can cook up to three hundred portions a day because the tools are already large from Pertamina. But the thing is, that many orders don't exist every day. We are only crowded if there are village events or official activities. On a normal day, we are quiet again and only rely on small orders. We actually hope that there will be regular cooperation, for example becoming a regular snack supplier for meetings at Pertamina's office or other companies in Cilegon, so that our income can be stable every month." (Interview with Informant 4d).

This uncertain market condition has not been able to be fully answered by the local government. The support from the Cilegon City Cooperatives & MSMEs Office so far is still limited to facilitating development exhibitions that are incidental in nature (sometimes only), not touching the creation of a binding supply chain network between MSMEs and large industries in Cilegon. This can be seen from the explanation of the representative of the Cilegon City Cooperatives & MSMEs Office (Informant 2a):

"We from the agency are certainly ready to support the sustainability of these MSMEs after they graduate from Pertamina's CSR fostering. The form of support will be that we will prioritize them to participate in regional development exhibitions, city-level MSME bazaars, or we will help display their products in the official souvenir gallery..." (Interview with Informant 2a).

From the point of view of program evaluation, the promotional model through exhibitions or bazaars alone is not enough to guarantee the long-term economic sustainability of traditional micro-enterprises (Miles et al., 2014). MSMEs in Gerem Village face a condition where they "can produce goods in large quantities and quality thanks to new tools, but are confused about who to sell to on a regular basis". Therefore, the economic benefits felt by the current residents are threatened to decline when assistance from companies is stopped, unless

the MSME Forum is able to penetrate the modern market network or establish a fixed supply contract with the surrounding industry independently.

2. The Paradox Between Social License to Operate and Essential Empowerment

The second crucial challenge that needs to be criticized is the difference in basic motivation between the company and the local community. The results of the word frequency analysis (*word frequency*) using NVivo 15 shows that the words "Program", "CSR", and "Society" appear the most dominant. From the perspective of public administration, the dominance of these words indicates that the MSME empowerment program is indirectly used by corporations as an instrument of securing defensive areas (self-protection) in order to obtain social permission from the community to operate quietly (SLO).

As a National Vital Object that manages the distribution of fuel oil on a large scale, FT Tanjung Gerem has a main interest in keeping the surrounding area safe, conducive, and free from social protests of residents. This security motivation is reflected in the statement of Mr. Sr. Spv HSSE (Informant 1b):

"We deliberately directed the economic empowerment program through the MSME Forum to the nearest demographic Ring One area. For our function at HSSE, the success of this program is measured by the creation of harmonious relationships with local residents. When the community feels the direct economic benefits of the company's presence, the potential for social friction or environmental protests around the outside of the fuel terminal can be minimized, so that national energy distribution operations can run safely and smoothly." (Interview with Informant 1b).

The above statement is supported by observations from Gerem Village Community Leaders (Informant 6a) who see this program from the perspective of the peace of the village environment:

"The residents here are very happy with the attention from Pertamina through the assistance of this business tool. The relationship between the village and the fuel terminal office is now very good and cool. The mothers have a positive business that makes money, so there are no more negative thoughts or protests from residents to the company because we feel that we have been paid attention to in real terms." (Interview with Informant 6a).

Critical analysis of the researcher sees the existence of a dilemmatic or paradoxical situation here (Ansell & Gash, 2008). On the one hand, this program is very good because it has succeeded in creating social peace and improving the welfare of households in areas close to the company's operations. But on the other hand, if the company's main goal of putting CSR funds has been achieved, namely the surrounding environmental conditions *fuel terminal* It has been considered safe, conducive, and there are no more demos, so there is a risk that the company's commitment to make deeper and long-term empowerment investments will decrease. Risky empowerment programs are only used as a momentary "peace-buying" tool (*social buffer*), not purely to make the community completely independent from dependence on SOE assistance (Elfianto et al., 2026).

The researcher assessed that the achievement of physical targets and the absorption of program resources had gone very well and provided real economic benefits for family income. However, in terms of Sustainability (*Sustainability*), this program still has weaknesses in the uncertain downstream market system as well as dependence on corporate security motivations. In order for this program to be fully sustainable, PT Pertamina Patra Niaga FT Tanjung Gerem

together with the MSME Forum must start shifting the focus of cooperation from just providing training tools, to the formation of a formal business ecosystem that has permanent buyers (*secured off-taker agreements*) outside the environment *fuel terminal*.

Research Implications

The empirical findings and critical analysis presented in the previous section not only serve as an answer to the research objectives, but also contribute to broader thinking. This section outlines the implications of the research born from the evaluation of the MSME Empowerment CSR Program of PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal (FT) Tanjung Gerem. These implications are divided into two main dimensions: theoretical implications that are useful for the enrichment of science (academic) and practical implications that serve as policy recommendations for stakeholders.

Theoretically, the results of this study provide a new perspective in the public administration science cluster, especially on the theory of policy evaluation and collaborative governance (*collaborative governance*). Use of six OECD/DAC evaluation criteria (*Relevance, Coherence, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact, Sustainability*) in this study, it has been proven that the success of an economic safety net cannot be measured partially or separately from the context of the industrial safety regulations that surround it.

1. Enrichment of OECD/DAC Evaluation Criteria: This study shows the existence of natural barriers that affect the criteria of Relevance and Sustainability. When a community empowerment program is carried out around the National Vital Object (*Obvitnas*) area such as a fuel terminal, the indicators of program suitability are not only determined by the real needs of the local community, but must be subject to corporate occupational safety compliance. This provides a theoretical contribution that in the context of the macro energy logistics industry, the relevance criterion has a capability ceiling that limits the variety and creativity of community business types in order to mitigate the risk of fire hazards.
2. Criticism of Collaborative Governance Theory: Findings on the existence of pseudo-*pentahelix* collaboration provide enrichment to the collaborative governance model of (Ansell & Gash, 2008). This research proves that the presence of cross-sector actors (Government, Private, Community) in the coordination forum does not automatically create a balanced power relationship. There is a corporate-driven collaboration phenomenon, where the private sector/state-owned enterprises become the dominant single actor because they control financial resources, while local governments tend to be passive-administrative. The theoretical implication is that the sustainability of a partnership program will always be prone to post-program collapse if there is no mixing of formal budget commitments (*resource pooling*) from the local government.

Based on the gaps and structural barriers found in the discussion process, this study gives birth to several practical implications in the form of concrete action directions for policy actors:

1. For PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal (FT) Tanjung Gerem
 - a. CSR Organizational Structure Reform: Corporations need to restructure their internal organizational structure by independently separating the social responsibility (CSR/Community Development) division from the HSSE technical division. This is important to eliminate dual role conflicts (split focus) in field officers, so that the daily

assistance function to MSME groups can run more flexibly, fluidly, and optimally without being disturbed by the rigid task of fuel terminal operational safety patrols.

- b. Modification of Training Time Design: *Comdev Officers* must change the method of conducting intensive training classes from a rigid full-day training pattern to a modular pattern that is scheduled on a regular and flexible basis. This step is needed to overcome the problem of time-poverty experienced by housewives as daily micro business actors, so that their participation in the program does not sacrifice the productivity of the family's daily economic turnover.
2. For the Cooperatives & MSMEs Office of Cilegon City and Urban Villages
 - a. Role Transformation from Passive to Active: Local governments must stop support patterns that are merely administrative validators (such as synchronization of data to prevent budget overlap or the granting of NIB/PIRT permits). The Cooperative Office must start allocating special coaching budget posts independently in the City Budget attached to the Gerem Village MSME Forum as a guarantee of readiness to take over the baton of assistance when Pertamina carries out an exit strategy.
 - b. Preparation of a Secured Off-Taker Ecosystem: In order to ensure business sustainability criteria and long-term economic benefits, the local government together with the MSME Forum must start building a legally binding fixed supply cooperation contract with the modern retail industry, hospitality, or large industrial catering networks in Cilegon City. This step is important so that the quality products produced by the community thanks to Pertamina's new machines have the certainty of a stable downstream market, not just relying on the bazaar agenda or regional momentum exhibitions that are temporary and uncertain.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of data analysis, field verification through triangulation techniques, and discussions using NVivo software, this study shows that the implementation of the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Program of PT Pertamina Patra Niaga Fuel Terminal Tanjung Gerem in empowering MSMEs has provided real benefits, but still faces various challenges. The main obstacles faced by the fostered MSMEs include limitations in production, processing, and marketing which are influenced by the socio-economic conditions of business actors, limited space due to industrial estates, and the lack of optimal business legality in the early stages of the program. From the governance aspect, the implementation of the program has been carried out in accordance with the company's goals and policies, but collaboration between companies, local governments, and the community is still not optimal because the role of the government is more administrative than as an active partner in empowerment. In addition, the focus of mentoring is also influenced by the company's limited internal resources. In terms of results, the program has succeeded in achieving administrative targets and is able to increase the income of fostered MSMEs, but the sustainability of the program still faces challenges in the form of limited sustainable market access and dependence on promotional activities and exhibitions. Therefore, it is necessary to strengthen synergy between stakeholders, improve the quality of mentoring, and develop marketing networks so that the benefits of CSR programs can be sustainable and have a wider impact on the empowerment of MSMEs. Based on the results of the research, it is suggested that PT Pertamina Patra Niaga

Fuel Terminal Tanjung Gerem strengthen the governance of CSR programs by increasing the focus of the community assistance function, developing a more flexible training schedule according to the conditions of MSME actors, and expanding marketing access through collaboration with various business partners. Local governments, especially the Cooperatives and MSMEs Office and Gerem Village, are expected to play a more active role in supporting the sustainability of the program through the provision of coaching budgets, sustainable mentoring, and facilitation of partnerships with the business sector and modern markets. Stronger collaboration between companies, the government, and the community is expected to be able to create a more effective, independent, and sustainable MSME empowerment program so that the benefits of CSR are not only felt in the short term, but also able to improve people's welfare in a sustainable manner.

REFERENCES

- Agus, A. (2020). Practicing of corporate social responsibility for community empowerment: A case of a mining company in Indonesia. *Randwick International of Social Science Journal*, 1(3), 608–618.
- Al Mamun, A., & Muniady, R. (2021). Effect of participation in development initiatives on competitive advantages, performance, and sustainability of micro-enterprises in Malaysia. *Contemporary Economics*, 15(2), 122–137.
- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571.
- Armansyah, A., & Fadjar, A. (2024). Regulation of corporate social responsibility through environmental development program: A review from a CSR perspective. *Jurnal Hukum Bisnis Bonum Commune*, 86–102.
- Bastianingrum, M. (2023). Pengaruh IPM, pendidikan, dan kemiskinan terhadap pertumbuhan ekonomi di kabupaten/kota Provinsi Banten. *Buletin Ekonomika Pembangunan*, 4(1), 57–82. <https://doi.org/10.21107/bep.v4i1.19394>
- Demokracia, V. D. (2024). Konsistensi pengaturan tanggung jawab sosial dan lingkungan perusahaan dalam peraturan perundang-undangan di Indonesia. *Justitia et Pax*, 39(1), 193–232. <https://doi.org/10.24002/jep.v39i1.7031>
- Elfianto, I., Saputra, N. R., Aktaniensia, N. A., & Nugraha, M. A. (2026). Determinan keberhasilan usaha mikro, kecil, dan menengah di Indonesia: Studi analisis regresi logistik biner. *Seminar Nasional Pariwisata dan Kewirausahaan (SNPK)*, 5, 76–90.
- Jackson, K., & Bazeley, P. (2019). *Qualitative data analysis with NVivo*.
- Kementerian BUMN. (2021). *Peraturan Menteri Badan Usaha Milik Negara Republik Indonesia*.
- Kunyanti, S. A., & Mujiono, M. (2021). Community empowerment-based corporate social responsibility program in Panglima Raja Village. *International Journal on Social Science, Economics and Art*, 11(1), 12–19.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1992). *Analisis data kualitatif: Buku sumber tentang metode-metode baru*. UI Press.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- OECD. (2021). *Applying evaluation criteria thoughtfully*. OECD Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1787/543e84ed-en>
- Patton, M. Q. (2008). *Utilization-focused evaluation* (4th ed.). Sage.
- Pearce, J. A., & Robinson, R. B. (2013). *Manajemen strategis: Formulasi, implementasi, dan pengendalian*. Salemba Empat.
- Poerwanto. (2010). *Corporate social responsibility: Menjinakkan gejolak sosial di era*

globalisasi. Pustaka Pelajar.

- Primec, A., & Belak, J. (2022). Sustainable CSR: Legal and managerial demands of the new EU legislation (CSRD) for the future corporate governance practices. *Sustainability*, 14(24), 16648.
- Rochayatun, S., Praktikto, H., Wardoyo, C., & Handayati, P. (2023). Competitive advantage as a mediating variable of corporate social responsibility programs' effect on SME sustainability. *Journal of Social Economics Research*, 10(2), 34–46.
- Safitri, S. E., Triwahyuningtyas, N., & Sugianto, S. (2022). Analisis faktor-faktor yang mempengaruhi tingkat kemiskinan di Provinsi Banten. *Sibatik Journal: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Sosial, Ekonomi, Budaya, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan*, 1(4), 259–274.
- Saleh, A., Mujahiddin, M., & Gunawan, M. D. (2022). Optimizing corporate social responsibility funds for community empowerment and regional planning in urban slums. *International Journal Reglement & Society (IJRS)*, 3(3), 203–209.
- Sari, N. T. P., & Kusumawati, A. (2022). Literature review: The efforts to strengthening of micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSME) in Indonesia. *Asian Journal of Management, Entrepreneurship and Social Science*, 2(1), 98–115.
- Wibisono, Y. (2007). *Membedah konsep dan aplikasi CSR: Corporate social responsibility*. Fascho Publishing.